



Chapter Nine

Consultation Efforts

**Documentation of consultation and public participation efforts during the drafting and public review period
of the Bay City Area Transportation Study (BCATS) 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan**



Section 1

BCATS 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan Description

The Bay City Area Transportation Study (BCATS) is the principal public agency, as per Section 134 (a), conducting regional transportation studies for the Bay City Urbanized Area. BCATS, through an agreement with the Bay County Board of Commissioners, provides management and policy functions for the transportation planning program as required by the Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU). BCATS provides transportation planning services on behalf of the metropolitan planning organization (MPO) for the cities of Bay City and Essexville and the townships of Bangor, Monitor, Hampton, Portsmouth, Kawkawlin, Frankenlust and Fraser (see page 1-4). The MPO is established by federal law in all urbanized areas of the nation to carry out the "3C" (continuing, cooperative and comprehensive) transportation planning process. This process is required for the area to continue to receive U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT) funding. Extensive USDOT funds are spent annually in the Bay City area for highway, bridge, transit, transportation enhancement and safety projects and improvements.

One major function of BCATS under federal law is to produce a transportation plan for the area. The transportation plan is used as a basis to guide the decision of where federal transportation funds should be spent. The transportation plan identifies the area's transportation needs through the year 2035 as well as projects, both funded and unfunded and policies to meet those needs. The plan shall include both long-term and short-term strategies/actions, including but not limited to, operations and management activities that lead to the systematic development of an integrated intermodal transportation system that facilitates the safe and efficient movement of people and goods in addressing current and future transportation demand. The transportation plan shall be reviewed and updated every five years in air quality attainment areas and at least triennially in non-attainment areas to confirm its validity and consistency with current and forecasted transportation and land use conditions and trends and to extend the forecast period. In updating a plan, BCATS shall base the update on the latest estimates and assumptions for population, land use, travel, employment, congestion and economic activity.

There was considerable and numerous discussions with city and township staff, airport staff, various DDA staff, and other community agencies during the course of the traffic demand model creation and development of the BCATS 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan (MTP). Many of these efforts will be ongoing even after the BCATS 2035 MTP is adopted. This chapter is designed to discuss those outreach and consultation efforts and detail what response or action was taken in regard to the comment.



Section 2

Public Involvement and Consultation Efforts

During the development of the Tri-City Travel Demand Model, which occurred from April 2004 through January 2007, nearly every city and township was contacted directly. These efforts included personal visits with every township and city offices in the BCATS study area, and at least a phone conversations with representative staff in townships and cities outside of the BCATS study area. The tabulation of building and demolition permits in the various units of government, as well as, verification of existing business locations required lengthy discussions with local supervisory, assessor, and/or building and zoning officials, as well as future development sites and an estimated time frame of the site development. Transportation issues were a main component of these data gathering discussions. These efforts were instrumental in analysis of the ongoing shift of persons and businesses which indicate shifting demands on the transportation system. This shifting demand of goods and services are reflected in the Travel Demand Model in future years by changes in the estimated traffic flows in those future years.

Those contacted include:

Within the BCATS Study Area

Bangor Township - Dan Darland, Township Assessor
Frankenlust Township - Paul Arnold, Township Assessor
Fraser Township - Dick Gramoski, Township Supervisor
Hampton Township - Terry Spegel, Township Supervisor
Kawkawlin Township - Roy Delorge, Township Supervisor
Monitor Township - Margaret Ford, Township Assessor
Portsmouth Township - Patty Peltier, Township Assessor
City of Bay City - Jim Bedell and Terry Moulane, Planning Department
City of Essexville - Dale Majerczyk, City Manager

Those outside the BCATS Study Area

Beaver Township - Dennis Volk, Township Assessor
Garfield Township - Allen Thompson, Township Building Inspector
Gibson Township - Allen Thompson, Township Building Inspector
Merritt Township - B & K Appraisals, Township Assessor
Mt. Forest Township - Allen Thompson, Township Building Inspector
Pinconning Township - Sharon Stalsberg, Township Supervisor
Williams Township - Paul Arnold, Township Assessor
City of Auburn - Paul Arnold, City Assessor



City of Pinconning - Allen Thompson, City Building Inspector

The building and demolition permit data will be a continuous data gathering effort over the life of the 2035 Plan. Additionally, the review of business locations within the BCATS study area will be an ongoing effort. Through this continuous social and economic data update process BCATS will maintain an open communication regarding transportation issues with the townships and cities within the BCATS area and within Bay County in general.

Bay County Offices:

BCATS staff had numerous and continuing contact with Mosquito Control, Bay County Drain Office, Bay County Soil Erosion Office, Bay County Environmental Affairs and Community Development Office, Bay County Equalization Office, Bay County Emergency Services, Bay County 911 and the Bay County Health Department. Each of these offices have their own unique and specific transportation related interests. For example, BCATS assisted Bay County Emergency Services in a project that supplied major ports with emergency action plans (EAG). BCATS has assisted the Bay County Health Department in creating route maps for emergency response planning purposes.

MBS Airport Contact:

There were numerous contacts with MBS International Airport staff during the drafting of the BCATS MTP. Existing Long Range Plans for BCATS and MBS International were exchanged on the first visit with MBS on June 12, 2006. The second visit on July 1, 2006 was specific to the Bay County Road Commission and was attended by Jim Lillo, Assistant Engineer of the Bay County Road Commission. At this meeting snow removal issues were addressed, and further discussions regarding possible Garfield Rd expansion and safety issues at the US-10/Garfield Rd interchange. The US-10/Garfield Rd interchange safety issues were discussed again at a meeting held at the local MDOT Transportation Service Center (TSC). BCATS staff, MDOT TSC and MDOT Region staff, MBS Manager, Williams Township Supervisor and Bay County Road Commission staff discussed the need for a new or improved interchange, particularly when the proposed new MBS terminal is completed.

Result:

Improved snow removal in Bay County and better coordination on snow removal with Saginaw County. Enhanced awareness by all transportation agency staff of the proposed new MBS terminal project. Improved understanding of the safety issues and concerns of the Garfield Rd/US-10 Interchange.

James Clements Airport Contact:



Initial phone contact with James Clements Airport Manager Doug Dodge occurred on November 29, 2006. A follow up visit and exchange of Long Range Plans took place on December 13, 2006.

Result:

BCATS staff obtained a better understanding of the future plans of James Clements Airport, and a better awareness of the issues facing the airport. Doug Dodge the airport manager has a better understanding of the function of BCATS.

Saginaw Port Alliance Contact:

Several phone discussions regarding waterborne freight in the BCATS and Saginaw Metropolitan Transportation Study areas were completed with Bill Webber, Chairman of the Saginaw Port Alliance.

Result:

Bill Webber has agreed to be a speaker at the Michigan Transportation Planners Association/Michigan Association of Regions annual conference to be held in July 2007 in Bay City. BCATS staff is reviewing possible funding sources that might be used to develop a regional port develop study. The studies focus would be on products or services that could be developed or enhanced in the local economy to better utilize our port facilities in the region.

Newspaper Contact:

Contact with the local newspaper, the Bay City Times, was conducted initial with the public outreach letter. BCATS staff met with Ryan Stanton, Bay City Times staff writer for Bay County Government, to discuss to draft 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan.

Result:

Ryan Stanton wrote an article regarding our transportation plan publish in the Bay City Times on April 2, 2007. The article also informed the readers of our public meeting with was held on April 5, 2007. Several of the attendees to the public meeting referenced the article by Ryan Stanton, as well as several email questions and phone calls. A copy of this article is included in Appendix D.

Other Contacts:

In the effort by BCATS to fully engage the public, BCATS sent out a letter informing various agencies, governments, and organizations in the area to solicit comments on the on the 2035



Metropolitan Transportation Plan and the candidate projects. A copy of this letter and a list of the recipients are included in Appendices E & F.

BCATS 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan Public Review Session & Other Public Comments

At the BCATS 2035 Metropolitan Transportation Plan Public Review session held on April, 5 2007 at the Wirt Public Library, 500 Center Ave, Bay City, Mi 48708, BCATS received comments from seven individuals. The participants were comprised of home owners on major streets, a city staff member, a local truck driver, a CDC director, and other concerned citizens. A Copy of the sign-in sheet and the filled out comment forms are included in Appendix G.

Comments received:

- Issues with traffic backup on Trumbull Ave between the intersections of Center Ave and Woodside Ave
- Traffic Backup resulting from a temporary traffic signal on M-13/M-84 at Evergreen Dr
- Issues with the deteriorating road condition on Woodside Ave between Liberty Bridge and Johnson St
- Westbound Center Ave - Unlevel surface
- Cass Ave Railroad crossing east of Broadway Ave needs repair
- Harrison St - Fremont to McGraw needs reconstructing
- Railroad crossing on Lincoln south of 22nd St needs repair
- Railroad crossing on McGraw East of M-13 needs repair
- Ridge Rd between M-15 and Scherumann St, too narrow and bad condition
- A southern truck bypass in Bay City to avoid beet trucks and other heavy vehicle from driving through downtown. Possible along the new bridge over the Saginaw River at Cass Ave.
- Resurface Lafayette between Garfield and Michigan Ave.

During the public review period, BCATS receive several letters, emails, and phone calls regard projects and information in the Metropolitan Transportation Plan. Those letters/comments are included in Appendix G along with the comments from the public review session.

Comments/Letters and Responses

BCATS received 3 letters from federal resource agencies, a comment check list form from Federal Highway Administration staff, one letter and one phone call from a state of Michigan resource agency, an email from the MDOT Transportation Service Center (TSC)office, one letter, two email comments and one phone call from the public during the comment period that ended April 17, 2007.



The following is a summary of the federal resource agency letter, the FHWA check list form, MDOT TSC email, the letter and two email comments and one phone call that were received and comments/responses to each. Copies of the letter and emails are included in this appendix after this comment section.

BCATS received an April 2, 2007 letter of response from Department of Agriculture stating concerns of potential impacts of projects on properties enrolled under Part 361 of NREPA (formerly PA 116, the Farmland and Open Space Preservation Act) and on established intra-county and inter-county drains.

Comment:

BCATS is unaware that any of the proposed projects will require additional property outside of the existing right-of-ways. Any project in or around intra-county or inter-county drains would be coordinated with the Bay County Drain Commissioner office.

BCATS received an April 10, 2007 letter from the United States Department of the Interior stating concerns regarding endangered species in the area, specifically the Bald Eagle, Indiana bat and eastern prairie fringed orchid. There was also concern regarding permit requirements in wetland areas.

Comment:

BCATS staff has contacted Ms. Lori Sargent of the Michigan Department of Natural Resources by email on June 1, 2007, as suggested in the letter, requesting information regarding occurrence of state listed protected species in the study area. Any information received will be made available to the BCATS implementing road agencies for use in their planning process. The review of permit requirements is part of the bid and review process required in the MDOT road bidding and contract process.

BCATS received an April 17, 2007 letter from the United States Environmental Protection Agency stating concerns mostly regarding roadway widening projects, projects involving new river crossings, or projects requiring acquisition of right-of-way.

Comment:

BCATS is unaware that any of the proposed projects will require additional property outside of the existing right-of- ways. BCATS staff contacted Newton Ellens of EPA on June 1 requesting access to a web-based mapping application tool, called NEPAassist, as offered in the April 17th letter. BCATS staff also requested information on available GIS data sets also mentioned in the April 17th letter. Any information obtained from these two sources will be made available to the BCATS implementing agencies.



A Transportation Plan Checklist for Meeting SAFETEA-LU Requirements for Metropolitan Areas completed by staff of the Federal Highway Administration was forwarded on to BCATS by MDOT planning staff on April 18, 2007. Concerns ranged from limited to no Transit projects listed, describing operational and management strategies to improve performance, an assessment of capital investment and other strategies to preserve the existing and projected future transportation infrastructure and provide for multimodal capacity increases. Additional comments regarding transportation and transit enhancement activities, documentation of consultation efforts, and explanation of safety elements that incorporates or summarizes the priorities, goals, countermeasures or projects, as well as, appropriate emergency relief and disaster preparedness plans and strategies.

Comment:

BCATS staff attempted to address each of the concerns noted in the checklist. BCATS met with Bay Metro staff May 30, 2007 and discussed comments relative to Transit. Bay Metro staff reviewed the draft language and clarified and enhanced the section describing Transit.

BCATS received an April 16, 2007 letter from the State of Michigan Department of Environmental Quality which stated any proposed construction projects would have to meet rules and regulations that pertain to Part 91, Soil Erosion and sedimentation Control, undergo certain procedures if any contamination is encountered during projects, use available data resources to identify lakes, streams/drains, wetlands and floodplains that could be impacted, and pursue information on Threatened and Endangered Species in project areas.

Comment:

Roadway construction projects obtain any and all permits required including soil erosion permits as part of the construction contract requirements. BCATS has and will continue to use available data resources to identify lakes, streams/drains, wetlands and floodplains in its roadway review process and provides such information to the implementing agencies. BCATS staff has contacted Ms. Lori Sargent of the Michigan Department of Natural Resources by email on June 1, 2007, as suggested in the letter, requesting information regarding occurrence of state listed protected species in the study area. Any information received will be made available to the BCATS implementing road agencies for use in their planning process.

BCATS received a phone call 3/23/07 from Lynne Rivard of the Michigan Department of Environmental Quality Bay Region Office inquiring if this letter was for the local office only or if she should forward to anyone else.

Comment:

After a brief discussion Lynne Rivard indicated she would note receiving the letter and forward it on to Rober Domke, Transportation Specialist of the Land and Water Management Division in Gaylord.



An email from Adam Rivard of the MDOT Transportation Service Center was received on March 22, 2007 indicating some changes in the MDOT projects listed in the draft BCATS MTP.

Comment:

BCATS staff implemented the changes identified.

BCATS received a letter of concern from Emmons Jr. and Dianne Engelhardt residing at 4737 Beverly Lane in Monitor Township. The letter indicated they were opposed to the addition of a center turn lane on Midland Road between Two Mile Road and Three Mile Road.

Comment:

BCATS staff contacted Mrs. Dianne Engelhardt and discussed the project and inquired about their specific objections. The Engelhardts didn't feel the traffic warranted the additional turn lane, and they were concerned that adding an additional lane would take some of their property which is adjacent to the roadway and located on the corner of Midland Road and Beverly Lane. I explained that if the roadway improvements did in fact take place, the improvements would most likely be within the existing road right of way.

An email comment from Perry Tytlewski was received on April 4, 2007 concerned about the Pine Road project and its impact on his residence at 1315 Pine Rd located at the south west corner of Pine and Nebobish Roads.

Comment:

BCATS staff responded to Mr. Tytlewski by providing contact information at the Bay County Road Commission where he could obtain more specific construction design information.

Caroline Hunt from Auburn phoned on April 4th and wanted to know when Ionia Street from Wenona Street to Euclid Avenue was going to be fixed. There are raised Manhole covers, sunken portions of road, high crowns, etc.

Comment:

BCATS staff phoned John Gaydos, Engineering Manager for the city of Bay City who indicated that the city was aware of the condition of the roadway but there is currently no funds identified to fix that road section. BCATS staff phoned Ms. Hunt back on April 5th and left that information on her answering machine.